

# Collaborative Governance in Kelompok Wanita Tani (KWT) Women's Empowerment Programs to Realize Food Security in Cilegon City

Farah Fatika Sari<sup>1</sup>

Student of Governance Studies, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Sultan Ageng Tirtayasa, Serang, Indonesia 6670170029@untirta.ac.id

# ABSTRACT

This study describe the process and implementation of the Collaborative governance program in the Kelompok Wanita Tani program is one of the main breakthroughs in providing family food security through yardland in Cilegon City. This is because the increase in food prices has experienced a spike. After all, the world's food reserves are experiencing a crisis, especially during the pandemic. This research aims to analyze the concept of Collaborative governance in the KWT program, understand the pattern of collaboration actors in the KWT program's implementation, and know the inhibiting and driving factors in the Collaborative governance process. By using the theory of Collaborative governance, Ansell and Gash, with the Collaborative governance Model, which includes: face-to-face dialogue, building trust, shared commitment, shared understanding, achievement of results, obtained the theoretical analysis which shows that the Collaborative governance process has not been distributed equally on KWT program in Cilegon City. It can be proved by the fact that there is no monitoring and evaluation schedule for KWT capital assistance that is given to all KWT in Cilegon City to execute the programs to actualize family food security, the lack of maintenance carried out by the government in increasing the participation of each member of the Kelompok Wanita Tani, there is still a lack of support from the sub-district government due to lack of understanding of the role in the KWT program, there are still KWT programs that did not make in a long-term collaboration between collaborating actors which caused the program only runs at the beginning of the program. Also, there is no harvest innovation product from all KWT in Cilegon City. This research hopes that it can be used as an evaluation material and tighten monitoring of the KWT program to actualize food security.

Keywords: Collaborative governance, Women Farmers Group, Food Security



#### Background

Kelompok Wanita Tani In fact, it already exists in regional areas in Indonesia, such as Java island, especially Banten Province, where the KWT program is under the auspices of the Ministry of Agriculture of the Republic of Indonesia and the Department of Agriculture and Food Security of Cilegon city, uniquely the city of Cilegon is appointed as the implementer of the KWT program which has an industrial city background, in this case, it is a challenge for the government so that the program can run as it should so that in this case, the government invites the public and the private sector to synergize together to run a women empowerment program for the Kelompok Wanita Tani. While stakeholders and the community as partners and managers where the community is the one who runs the program and contributes its aspirations and ideas to the program.

Collaborative governance becomes an appropriate concept used to build community progress through community empowerment in improving food security where the concept of empowerment is an effort to obtain and provide strength to individuals and weak communities to identify, analyze, determine the needs and potential and problems faced, as well as choose alternative solutions by optimizing their resources and potential independently and Actualize the existing capacity in society. In this case, the government party relies not only on its internal capacity but also on implementing a policy and implementing the program.

Factors support the running of a policy or program and encourage the government to collaborate with various parties, both with fellow governments, private parties, and communities and civil society communities, so that collaboration can be established in achieving common goals in overcoming Resources, Limitations of capabilities, and Networks.

The form of collaboration is an effort to empower the community, especially women in every village in Cilegon City. Seeing the situation of countries that have guaranteed food security makes household food security an indicator of the formation of regional food security in the region or regionally. The increasing share of food expenditure of a household, the lower the household's food security.

But the problem facing Indonesia is the food crisis due to many factors, including the decline in the number of agricultural lands due to massive industrialization, population growth, and the number of farmers decreasing because it is considered unprofitable. As one of the provinces impacting national food security, especially food availability. Judging from the population and population density, with a population of 12.68 million people, Banten Province is the fifth largest densely populated area in Indonesia; therefore, the current population density has an impact on the amount and quality of food that the government must provide to be able to meet the food and nutritional needs of its population.

Food design must pay attention to the growth and distribution of the population described in government regulations in article 7 of Law No. 18 of 2012. This shows that



population numbers and density have an important role in realizing and improving food security. Based on the food security and food vulnerability map (FSVA) in 2018, Banten Province is included in food conditions (priority 5). Banten province is included in the food resistance category. However, Tanziha's research (2005) results said about 9.3% of the residents in Banten province suffer from hunger. (Erli Mutiara, 2008)

Food security is built on four pillars there are (1) readiness, the availability of food that is quite good in the amount and quality (2) access is the ease of obtaining and having the resources to get food (3) utilization, namely the right user based on nutritional knowledge (4) stability of availability, access, and utilization. If the four pillars can be carried out properly, then the fulfillment of food for the country up to individuals, which is reflected in the availability of sufficient food, both in quantity and quality, nutritious, safe, diverse, equitable and affordable, not contrary to the religion, beliefs, and culture of the community, to be able to live healthy, active and productive.

Cilegon City is one of Banten Province's cities with strategic characteristics. This city is small and still young as an entrance and exit to the Sumatra region. Cilegon's geographical location is at the western end of Java Island and has 17,550 hectares. The area is bordered by the Sunda Strait West of Bojonegara District to the north, Anyar and Mancak District to the south, and east of the border with Keramatwatu District. Cilegon city itself includes a city that is still thick with religious culture. The potentials of the region are known strategically in the field of economy, society, and quite fertile agricultural land so that areas such as in Cilegon are suitable for planting a variety of foodstuffs, especially vegetables.

The concept of community empowerment in Cilegon City is a relevant solution to solve social problems, ranging from family welfare problems, women's rights, and improving family food security. The concept of farmer organizations and economic institutions is something that must be grown and developed from, by and for Indonesian agriculture, referring to the regulation of the Minister of Agriculture (Permentan) Number 82 of 2013 through the local government program women farmers group can be felt by the community where the Kelompok Wanita Tani is a program related to women empowerment. The creation of this Kelompok Wanita Tani program started from the ministry program and was then addressed to the local government. Implemented through collaborative governance, Cilegon City became one of the selected cities to implement the program.

Seeing the number of women in Cilegon, the majority are still in the productive age of work and only become homemakers, then do not have the provision of skills and do not earn. The existence of innovative policies such as women's farming groups as an effort to embrace stakeholders and private parties to contribute to development, as a form of collaborative governance that is expected to be real action related to the results of policy engineering to build citizens into a target point of collaborative actors.

In terms of the development of empowerment of women farmers' groups implementing collaborative governance in developing the agricultural sector, it is undeniable that the



welfare of farmers and improving food security have become a responsibility of the government, society, and stakeholders. Here is the data of women farmers' groups in Cilegon City:

KECAMATAN	JUMLAH KELOMPOK WANITA TANI	JUMLAH ANGGOTA PER- KECAMATAN	KETERANGAN	
			Aktif	Tidak Aktif
Kecamatan Citangkil	11 KWT	271 anggota	5 KWT	6 KWT
Kecamatan Purwakarta	6 KWT	112 anggota	5 KWT	21 KWT
Kecamatan Cibeber	5 KWT	122 anggota	5 KWT	-
Kecamatan Jombang	4 KWT	90 anggota	2 KWT	2 KWT
Kecamatan Cilegon	5 KWT	95 anggota	5 KWT	-
Kecamatan Ciwandan	9 KWT	283 Anggota	5 KWT	4 KWT
Kecamatan Grogol	7 KWT	152 anggota	6 KWT	1 KWT
Kecamatan Pulomerak	4 KWT	80 anggota	KWT	1 KWT

Table 1Data of Kelompok Wanita Tani Cilegon City

Source: Agricultural and Food Security Office of Cilegon City, 2020)

From the table above, it can be known that of the 50 groups of peasant women (in Cilegon City, only 36 groups are still active, especially in Grogol, Ciwandan, and Jombang Districts. This is due to the lack of attention from each subdistricts party to empowerment or development in each group. The farmer's women's group was created to empower thousands of households to improve the family food security economy. Therefore the group of peasant women needs to be formed by using home yard land planted with vegetables for land use of yard and greening the environment. As a community empowerment group formed in 2011, it is not easy for community groups to carry out programs and carry out their duties and roles. Moreover, carrying out programs or activities will usually require infrastructure and human resources capital to grow cohesiveness in members.

This is a challenge and an obstacle faced by the peasant women's group administrators. This was recognized directly by Sutardi, Sp as the head of the field of food consumption which is also part of the administration and management of PPH (Desirable Dietary Pattern), the



attitude of the village government that is not ready to face conflicts in the community, the formation of peasant women groups in each village only as a formality.

This shows that the village government chooses the processes and policies in the implementation of Collaborative governance still attaches importance to sectoral egos only. (Results of the researcher's interview with Sutardi SP on September 05, 2020). In the mechanism, the government is still trying to achieve the results for this group of women farmers. They feel it as administrators. So, that the early period of the first year of the farmer women's group, the Agriculture Office only took a few pilot gardens in 3 villages that were considered capable of carrying out the P2L program and then, in the following years, produced results that from one village could develop into 43 groups in each village. Until 2020 there were more than 43 groups of peasant women. But for now, there has been no relationship and cooperation with private parties from several companies in Cilegon City.

Thus, the task of local governments in the field of food is placed in Law No. 23 of 2014. The local government explained in government regulation number 17 of 2015 concerning food security and nutrition that government affairs must include food written in Article 12 of law number 23 of 2014. Government regulation number 17 of 2015 concerning food security and nutrition regulates the participation of local governments related to local government food reserves, food crisis preparedness and food crisis management, food distribution and food assistance, Supervision, Food and nutrition information systems, and community participation.

Cilegon city government itself, as stipulated in the government laws and regulations, is responsible for realizing food security in its territory. The urban spatial planning that strongly prioritizes industrialization, rationality, and capital accumulation still has high cultural value, especially in agriculture, one of which is a group of peasant women who contribute to agricultural development to reduce poverty, encourage equitable communities and maintain family food security.

The rapid increase in the number of residents every year greatly affects the fulfillment of food sovereignty; the transfer of agricultural land functions to be used as residential and industrial land will continue to increase. Land transfer leads to an increase in residents and continues increased environmental pollution.

This causes the group of peasant women; almost all groups of women farmers in Cilegon city do not have their land but borrowed land owned by the community. Because of these factors, food security is increasingly experiencing a decrease in the amount of land due to the transition of agricultural land functions, shrinking agricultural land and plantations in this steel city, due to the transfer of land functions for massive industrialization from agricultural land to residential buildings and shops.

The Cilegon City bureau of statistics noted that in 2016 as many as 1,600 hectares of 2,500 hectares of agricultural land in Cilegon City continued to decrease, especially every year, the most used for new industrial projects and housing. Automatically agricultural land used by



farmers in the city is known to be strategically reduced by 900 hectares from the original 2,500 hectares.

The transition of land functions that are increasing, of course, also affects the community's interest, especially young people in the agricultural world who prefer to become factory workers, even though the number of productive workers working in the agricultural sector will be able to improve the quality and quantity of agricultural products produced, so that food security is expected to be easier to achieve. When this is appropriate, the remaining agricultural land should be maintained so as not to decrease because agriculture was the community's main livelihood in the past. Several factors can improve food security in Cilegon City, including empowering women in Kelompok Wanita Tani and empowering farmers' groups by looking at existing problems so that collaboration can solve existing problems

# Literature Review Collaborative Governance

Until now, many experts have tried to describe the understanding of collaborative governance starting from various points of view. And of all the definitions, there is a continuity of the relationship between government cooperation and non-state stakeholders despite many differences and similarities from a language point of view. Speaking of collaborative governance, the discussion can never be separated from the discussion about state and community relations. The government emphasizes the involvement of non-governmental organizations. It contains a very complex meaning, namely the involvement of public institutions in the formulation and the implementation of connected policies from various organizations to carry out public goals.

The process of collaboration has several stages. A stage of the model is that collaboration is considered important to be considered a strategy in managing public affairs. Although the collaborative process is difficult to do because the characters of each stakeholder are different. (Ansell & Gash, 2008).

1. Face to face dialog

A form of collaborative governance is established through face-to-face dialogue directly through the stakeholders involved. As collaborative governance is processoriented, direct dialogue is essential to benefit and identify opportunities mutually. Dialogue directly is not merely a superficial negotiation. In this case, dialogue between farmer's women group members can directly minimize the gap and disrespect between the stakeholders involved. Thus, stakeholders can work together according to goals and benefits.

2. Trust Building

Trust is one of the important things in the collaboration process. It is normal for the parties who collaborate not to trust each other. Therefore, mutual trust is one of the things that must be built at the beginning of the agreement. Building trust also does



not take a short time, this is because collaboration requires continuous communication and adjustment to the current conditions from the re-emergence of conflicts in the past. Because policymakers or stakeholders must allocate time to repeat trust-building effectively. If it is not done, then collaboration should not be done.

3. Commitment to process

Commitment is a form of motivation to participate in collaborative governance. A strong commitment from each stakeholder is needed to prevent risks from the collaboration process. It's just that commitment is complicated in collaboration, but stakeholders' responsibility to view relationships done as new, and those responsibilities need to be redeveloped.

4. Share Understanding

Stakeholders must understand each other's needs and goals and the goals of others involved in the collaboration. The collaboration process must have a common vision to unite differences of interests among interested parties.

5. Intermediate Outcomes

The advanced results of the collaboration process are realized in the form of tangible results. This is the result of a critical and primary process in developing momentum that can guide the success of a collaboration. Intermediate outcomes arise when goals that benefit from the collaboration are relatively concrete and when "small wins" of collaboration may occur.

Collaboration in governance, according to De Seve in (Lukito et al., 2016: 36), eight indicators are used as assessors of whether the collaboration carried out by the government can be said to be successful or vice versa, there are:

1. Network Structure

In collaborative governance, the network formed should not be hierarchical, with a higher position and suppressive power under it. While the network formed must be organized through the network structure involved. Namely, there is no position of power, dominance, and monopoly. Thus, each party has equal rights, responsibilities of obligations, strengths, and opportunities for accessibility in achieving common goals.

2. Commitment showed toward the goal

A collaboration should not benefit only a few parties. All parties, including the people, must benefit or positively impact the existence of such collaboration.

3. Trust

Every stakeholder must trust each other as a form of professional relationship established to achieve successful implementation of collaboration.

4. Governance

The relationship of mutual trust between the actors of governance or government is important. In addition, some rules are mutually agreed upon by each stakeholder, and there are deliberations for the freedom to determine how collaboration is carried out. As a clean milking, there must be clarity on who is a member and not a member.



# 5. Access to Authority

In Access to Authority, there are already clear authority rules accepted by each stakeholder to carry out their roles according to their authority. And it can be widely accepted according to the clear provisions of the procedure.

### Women's Empowerment

Women's empowerment is the ability to gain access to and control over resources, economic, political, social, and cultural, so that women can organize themselves and increase self-confidence to build their abilities and self-concept. Women's empowerment needs to be improved in development and food security development. (Kortschak Irfan, 2010:63) So with the empowerment of women, they can try to reallocate power through changing social structures.

That way, the position of women will improve only when women can be independent and can master decisions related to their lives. An activity can be said to be the empowerment of women if it has two characteristics below, they are:

- 1. How to describe the emancipatory interests that can encourage people to participate together in development.
- 2. As a process of involvement of themselves or society in enlightenment, awareness, and organizing together so that they can participate.

Empowerment is a method of changing a person's life, making a person rule over his own life. Therefore, the empowerment process is carried out gradually and cannot be done in a hurry. Here are the stages in making the distinction:

- 1. This stage of behavior formation aims to increase awareness and concern to understand the reasons for empowering and increasing self-capacity.
- 2. The stages of transformation of abilities are carried out by providing skills and skills to support their activities.
- 3. The stage of improving intellectual abilities and skills makes the emergence of an initiative to cause innovation leads to self-reliance.

## Kelompok Wanita Tani

Kelompok Wanita Tani is a group of peasant women or women of productive age who have the same willingness to farm based on common interests, social and environmental conditions, the similarity of commodities, and economic resources. The establishment of this farmer women's group is a form of government effort that aims to increase the productivity rate of homemakers, help each head of the family meet basic food needs at an affordable price, and reduce stunting rates in children.

The Ministry of Agriculture first initiated the Kelompok Wanita Tani program because it is following the role of local governments in the field of food as listed in Law No. 23 of 2014 and government regulation No. 17 of 2015 on food security and nutrition regulates the



participation of local governments related to local government food reserves, food diversity, food distribution, food crisis preparedness and the overthrow of food and aid crises, supervision, food, and nutrition information systems and community participation.

This is a form of the government effort to protect and help underprivileged communities using community empowerment. Through ministerial regulations, it is then issued with policy regulations on the role of local governments in covering food.

#### Method

The research method used is a qualitative approach is described in depth. In this study, qualitative methods as a research procedure produce descriptive data in written or spoken words of people and behaviors that Can be observed Bogdan and Taylor, (in Moleong, 2009: 4). To solve the problems that are the main focus of this research study, the approach used in this research is a qualitative approach with descriptive methods. According to Azwar, descriptive research in conducting analysis only to the level of a thesis, namely analyzing and presenting facts systematically so that it can be easier to understand and conclude (Hasan, 2002: 22)

The data sources that will be qualitatively analyzed in this study are primary and secondary data, by obtaining data through literature study searches and conducting online interviews with the parties concerned. Secondary data is data that is not self-attempted collection by researchers, for example, from other publications. The source of data in this study is derived from interviews with sources and books, research journals, newspapers, and online media portals.

#### **Result and Discussion**

The study results can be seen from the indicators used in this study, describing this discussion per indicator starting from face-to-face dialogue, Trust Building, Commitment to process, Shared Understanding, and Intermediate Outcomes.

First, face-to-face dialogue in the Collaborative governance process in the program and implementation of the Kelompok Wanita Tani has been directed and built good communication judging from the goals and objectives to be achieved fully seen by each collaboration agent and from each agent already understands what to do. However, its implementation has not been optimally characterized by not all of the Cilegon City KWT can collaborate with the private sector, namely the company, if it is not included in the company's integrity area, for the city of Cilegon itself, only Ciwandan and Grogol Districts can feel collaboration with the private sector.

Second, Trust Building in the Collaborative governance process in the Kelompok Wanita Tani program that researchers researched has built trust between collaboration agencies.



However, there must still be the maintenance in it because what researchers see is the balance of Collaborative governance between agents but not trust between members of the farmer's women group itself. There is still suspicion of budget transparency than the government's uneven initial capital allocation to each KWT.

Third, Commitment to Process In a collaboration process becomes important because, without a joint commitment, a collaboration program cannot run optimally. Researchers see for commitment between collaboration agents has run optimally characterized by socialization and field monitoring. It's just that researchers found in the field there is still low participation from members of the peasant women's group itself.

Fourth, Shared Understanding in the Collaborative governance process is quite optimal. This is characterized by solving problems together if there is a problem in the farmer's women group, such as obstacles in managing waste harvested that can be processed into organic fertilizer. PT Pertamina provides training in making organic fertilizers in collaboration with digital waste.

Fifth, Intermediate Outcomes In the Collaborative governance program that researchers see is not optimal, it is still not optimal because there has been no food innovation from this KWT program from all collaboration agencies such as the government, civil society, and private sector parties but not only academics. However, many opportunities can be obtained if collaborating with academics.

The provisional results obtained from the collaborative governance process between governments, stakeholders, and private parties, in this case, are illustrated through commitments from companies from the government and from KWT itself as the output of problems in the process of implementing collaborative governance that disturbs collaboration actors. There is a major point of unrest in this research made; namely, the author traced the presence of inequality and poverty in the Cilegon City region. There was a food crisis due to many factors, including the decline in the number of agricultural lands due to massive industrialization, population increase, and the number of farmers decreasing because it is considered unprofitable.

The food crisis in family food needs is the cause of the loss of land and livelihoods of farmers who are replaced by industrialization and the lack of regeneration of farmers today, thus causing faltering food adequacy in the scope of community households. Achieving a successful development is determined by the availability of quality human resources (SDM). They are human resources who have physical, strong mental, excellent health, and are smart. Empirical evidence suggests that this is largely determined by good nutritional status, and good nutritional status is determined by the amount of food consumed. Food consumption factors and stunting directly influence malnutrition and poor nutrition problems. It is indirectly influenced by food availability and socio-economic, cultural, and political factors.



Socio-economic factors of inequality and poverty can be inhibitory factors in national development. Therefore, to anticipate the occurrence of stunting in children and poverty due to the food crisis, the Cilegon City government created a women's empowerment program for women's farming groups by utilizing yardland and sleeping land in urban farming farmland to help meet family food needs for the people of Cilegon City affected by poverty. In addition, this program becomes a temporary output and answers to the community's restlessness; this program also provides provisions for agricultural science for the community for the Kelompok Wanita Tani program.

The projection of home yardland into agricultural land was triggered for the first time by a government initiative that implemented the direction of the Minister of Agriculture to regulate the participation of the government and the community.

The government and the community realized this program to create agricultural land in the house's yard for the community. This means that people in Cilegon City are expected to be able to develop their home yards into agricultural land to meet their own household needs and no longer depend on income.

Referring to Government Regulation No. 17 of 2015 concerning food security and nutrition, the author also sees the relationship with Law No. 23 of 2014, which more or less states similar things to Government Regulations. In the scientific study, the author relates the collaborative governance process from (Ansell and grash, 2008). Collaborative governance theory is a comprehensive and appropriate component used in answering problems related to structured and planned collaboration. It includes the government and private parties that join forces to overcome a problem in a region.

Collaboration in theory described by Ansell and grash is a collaborative governance model. Then collaborative governance is a theory that explains specifically how the process of collaboration that is dynamic and structured that is expected to produce actions and temporary impacts of collaborative activities carried out as an effort to solve problems in a phenomenon.

In the process that occurs in the field, the author sees for himself there are stages arranged so that the women's empowerment program of the peasant women's group implemented by collaboration between the government and the community can produce actions and temporary impacts from this collaboration activity. This is done because they have one goal: to empower the community, especially women, to use the yardland. Thus, the discussion above proves that the collaborative governance process in empowering women's peasant groups can solve problems in a phenomenon.

We review the collaborative governance process again from the detailed presentation of the Kelompok Wanita Tani program process. The achievement of temporary results from the implementation of this program is to produce food staples that can be planted and reprocessed for the community. The establishment of cooperation between collaboration



actors and the Harvest is an example of achieving the results of this program to help meet the food needs of members of women's farmers and communities. Therefore, the Collaborative governance model in this problem reflects how a collaborative process runs following the truth of existing theories.

The provisional result of this study is the formation of a collaboration agent with a sense of responsibility to manage, supervise, and follow up on problems in the KWT program to improve the fulfillment of food adequacy for the poor in Cilegon City. This program will continue to be well managed by actors and assisted by the community to become a program that can create breakthroughs in agriculture and become a pilot for cities with similar problems.

#### Conclusion

In general, the authors concluded that the collaboration carried out by the Cilegon City Agricultural Office with private parties such as PT. Pertamina and PT. MCCI and civil society is a program based on the government's concern for the community to help reduce stunting, poverty, and women's inequality. Not only that, but this program is also based on the systematic collaboration carried out, namely the Collaborative governance model where the government becomes a pilot and becomes an actor who has tupoksi in this program is then assisted also by private parties and stakeholders.

Here are the core conclusions that the author can conclude in the research on the Collaborative governance process in the empowerment program of Kelompok Wanita Tani to realize food security in Cilegon City is quite optimal; it's just that there are still some problems in the process of implementing this program, among others, they are:

First, judging from the Face-to-Face Dialogue communication intended for collaboration actors in this program, both implementers and KWT members know the purpose and objectives of this program clearly; this program is intended for women who want to have skills in managing and farming by utilizing home yards, but not all KWT researchers in Cilegon City collaborate with private parties only two regions such as in Grogol and Ciwandan District collaborates with companies, making it difficult for other KWT to get attention.

Second, Trust Building resources in the collaboration agents involved already understand the tupoksi that must be implemented in solving problems in the collaboration process in the Kelompok Wanita Tani, but not yet maximal in its implementation. The financial resources provided are well managed for the needs of the kwt program implementation. There is no monitoring schedule to check related financial resources that have not been evenly



accommodated in the sense of KWT capital assistance that has not been given to all KWT in Cilegon City to be able to run programs to realize family food security.

Third, Commitment to Process in the collaborative governance process has not run optimally, characterized by a lack of maintenance carried out by the government in increasing the participation of each member of Kelompok Wanita Tani.

Fourth, Shared Understanding in the Collaborative governance process on the empowerment of this farmer women's group, the community responds well to the existence of this KWT program. There has been a joint solution in dealing with problems in KWT. At the same time, there is still a lack of support from the village government.

Fifth, the Intermediate Outcomes collaborative governance process in the empowerment program of Kelompok Wanita Tani has not been optimal, characterized by the still encounter of KWT programs that are not long-term in collaborating with collaboration agencies, so that the program only runs at the beginning of the program. At the same time, there is no innovative product from the harvest of the many KWT in Cilegon City.



#### References

- Andi Nur, Collaborative Governance Dalam Pengelolaan Sampah Di Kelurahan Paropo Kecamatan Panakukang Kota Makassar (Bank Sampah Pusat), Skripsi Fakultas Fisip Universitas Muhammadiyah Makassar 2018.
- Nur Aafifah, Pemberdayaan Kelompok Wanita Tani (KWT) Asri di Dukuh Dawung Kelurahan Kedungpane Kecamatan Mijen Kota Semarang, Skripsi Fakultas iilmu Pendidikan Universitas Negeri Semarang, 2019.
- Purnamasari, Lucya, Pemberdayaan Perempuan Melalui Kelompok Wanita Tani (KWT) Bagi Aktualisasi Perempuan di Desa Kemanukan, Bagelen, Purworejo, Jateng, Skripsi Fakultas ilmu Pendidikan Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta, 2015.
- Ansell, Chris, and Alison Gash. 2008. "Collaborative Governance in Theory and Practice." Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory 18 (4): 543–71. https://doi.org/10.1093/jopart/mum032.
- Arida, Agustina & dkk. 2015. Analisis Ketahanan Pangan Rumah Tangga Berdasarkan Proporsi Pengeluaran Pangan dan Konsumsi Energi (Studi Kasus pada Rumah Tangga Petani Peserta Program Desa Mandiri Pangan di Kecamatan indrapuri Kabupaten Aceh Besar). Jurnal agrobisnis vol 16 No 1. BPS, 2019
- Emerson, Kirk, Tina Nabatchi, and Stephen Balogh. 2012. "An Integrative Framework for Collaborative Governance." Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory 22 (1): 1–29. https://doi.org/10.1093/jopart/mur011.
- Irawan, Denny. 2016. "COLLABORATIVE GOVERNANCE (Studi Deskriptif Proses Pemerintahan Kolaboratif Dalam Pengendalian Pencemaran Udara Di Kota Surabaya)."
- Iyoega, R.R.Trilestari, E.R., & Kirana, C.A.D., (2020). Collaborative Governance dalam Pembangunan Sektor Pertanian di Kabupaten Bandung. PERSPEKTIF, 9 (1): 55-65.
- Ervinawati dkk. 2015. Peranan Kelompok Wanita Tani Perdesaan Dalam Menunjang Pendapatan Keluarga (Di Dusun Beringin Desa Sungai Rengas Kecamatan Sungai Kakap, Kabupaten Kubu Raya Provinsi Kalimantan Barat). Jurnal Tesis PMIS Untan PSS.
- Fatimah, P., Mahsyar, A., & Kasmad, R. (n.d.). COLLABORATIVE GOVERNANCE DALAM PEMBERDAYAAN KELOMPOK TANI DI KABUPATEN WAJO. https://journal.unismuh.ac.id/index.php/kimap/index
- Putri, Abdul, Rulinawaty dkk (2021). Collaborative Governance dalam Pemberdayaan Kelompok Tani di Kabupaten Wajo. Vol 2, No 1, Februari 2021. http://Journal.unismuh.ac.id/index.php/kimap/index.



- Irawan, Denny. 2016. "Collaborative Governance (Studi Deskriptif Proses Pemerintahan Kolaboratif Dalam Pengendalian Pencemaran Udara Di Kota Surabaya)." http://sits.dishub.surabaya.go.id/ver2/berita-.
- Kurniasih, D., Setyoko, P. i., & imron, M. (2017). Model Penguatan Kelembagaan Pada Program Sanitasi Lingkungan Berbasis Masyarakat (SLBM) Di Kabupaten Banyumas (Suatu Pendekatan Collaborative Governance). Sosiohumaniora, Vol 1 No 1, April 2017.
- Lukito, Oleh: Dan Aris, and Tri Haryanto. 2016. COLLABORATIVE GOVERNANCE DALAM PENGEMBANGAN KERAJINAN BLANGKON DI KECAMATAN SERENGAN KOTA SURAKARTA. Ji@P. Vol. 3.
- Moore, M., & Hartley, J. (2008). Innovations in governance. Public Management Review, 10(1), 37-41. https://doi.org/10.1080/14719030701763161
- Minarni, Endang Warih, dkk. 2017. Pemberdayaan Kelompok Wanita Tani Melalui Optimalisasi Pemanfaatan Pekarangan Dengan Budidaya Sayuran Organik Dataran Rendah Berbasis Kearifan Lokal Dan Berkelanjutan. Jurnal Pengabdian Dan Pemberdayaan Masyarakat Volume 1 No 1.
- Mutiarawati, Tika. 2017. Collaborative Governance dalam Penanganan Rob di Kelurahan Bandengan Kota Pekalongan. Jurnal Wacana Publik Vol 1 No 2, 2017 hlm 48-62.
- Novian, Budhy. (2010). Sekilas Tenang Pemberdayaan Perempuan. Artikel Sanggar Kegiatan Belajar Kota Pangkalpinang, Kepulauan Bangka Belitung.
- Ramadhan, G. (2020). Media Pengembangan Ilmu dan Praktek Administrasi Fintech and Collaborative Governance at Farming in Banten INFORMASI ARTIKEL ABSTRAK. Jurnal Ilmu Administrasi, 17(1), 129–144.
- Whitford, A. B., Lee, S. Y., Yun, T., & Jung, C. S. (2010). Collaborative behavior and the performance of government agencies. International Public Management Journal, Vol 13 No 4, Februari 2010.
- Wirawan, Vani. 2020. Penerapan E-Government dalam Menyongsong Era Revolusi industri 4.0 Kontemporer di indonesi. Jurnal Penegak Hukum dan Keadilan, Vol.
- Ansell, C., & Gash, A. (2008). Collaborative governance in theory and practice. In Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory (Vol. 18, Issue 4). https://doi.org/10.1093/jopart/mum032